

## CLYDESDALE HOUSING ASSOCIATION LIMITED

**Policy:** Management Committee Appraisal

**Date:** 27 March 2019

**Lead Officer:** Chief Executive

**Review Date:** March 2022

**Regulatory Standard:** **Standard 6**  
The Management Committee and senior officers have the skills and knowledge they need to be effective.

### **Regulatory Guidance:**

- 6.1 The RSL has a formal, rigorous and transparent process for the election, appointment and recruitment of Management Committee members. The RSL formally and actively plans to ensure orderly succession to Management Committee places to maintain an appropriate and effective composition of Management Committee members and to ensure sustainability of the Management Committee.
- 6.2 The Management Committee annually assesses the skills, knowledge, diversity and objectivity it needs to provide capable leadership, control and constructive challenge to achieve the RSL's purpose, deliver good tenant outcomes, and manage its affairs. It assesses the contribution of continuing Management Committee members, and what gaps there are that need to be filled.
- 6.3 The RSL ensures that all Management Committee members are subject to annual performance reviews to assess their contribution and effectiveness. The Management Committee takes account of these annual performance reviews and its skills needs in its succession planning and learning and development plans. The Management Committee ensures that any non-executive member seeking re-election after nine years' continuous service demonstrates continued effectiveness.
- 6.5 The RSL ensures all new Management Committee members receive an effective induction programme to enable them to fully understand and exercise their governance responsibilities. Existing Management Committee members are given ongoing support and training to gain, or refresh, skills and expertise and sustain their continued effectiveness.

**Clydesdale Housing Association will provide this policy on request at no cost, in large print, in Braille, in audio or other non-written format, and in a variety of languages.**

# Contents

<b>Background .....</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>Policy Objectives.....</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>Management Committee Appraisal.....</b>	<b>3</b>
Positive approach.....	4
Assessing the Management Committee’s Collective Performance .....	4
Individual Management Committee Member Appraisal .....	5
Appraising the Chairperson .....	7
<b>Policy Review .....</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>Appendix 1: Management Committee Meeting Evaluation Record.....</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>Appendix 2: Individual Learning Statement Example .....</b>	<b>10</b>

## Background

1. Clydesdale Housing Association's (CHA) Management Committee consists of up to 15 volunteers from diverse backgrounds, with varied experience and different expertise levels. Responsible for providing collective leadership in setting and achieving strategic objectives, the Management Committee must also control the activities of CHA and ensure that they remain within the law, its Rules and relevant regulatory requirements.
2. The Management Committee therefore require mechanisms that will enable it to review its performance and ensure that its members acquire and continue to develop the necessary skills and knowledge that will support individual and collective effectiveness.

## Policy Objectives

3. The objectives of this policy and procedure are as follows:
  - implement measures to ensure the effective performance of the Management Committee as a whole;
  - implement measures for the effective performance of individual Management Committee members, including the Chairperson;
  - identify individual skill and knowledge development areas that, when addressed, will lead to greater effectiveness of the Management Committee;
  - identify how more experienced Management Committee members and their less experienced colleagues can exchange skills and experience;
  - assess Management Committee members' continuing levels of objectivity, effectiveness and ability to offer independent challenge;
  - comply with CHA's Rules (Rules 37.6 and 59.5.11 )<sup>1</sup>.

## Management Committee Appraisal

4. The best appraisal systems reinforce positive roles for participants to aspire to and also do not baulk at teasing out and addressing, issues that are smouldering away beneath the surface (meeting after meeting...year after year). More

---

<sup>1</sup> Rule 37.6: The Committee shall assess annually the skills, knowledge, diversity and objectivity that it needs for its decision making and what is contributed by the Committee Members by way of annual performance reviews. The Committee must satisfy itself that any Committee Member seeking re-election to the Committee after service as a Committee Member for a continuous period in excess of 9 years can demonstrate his/her continued effectiveness as a Committee Member.

Rule 59.5.11: Among the responsibilities of the Chairperson are that: appraisal of the performance of Committee Members is undertaken.

positively, the best practices are highlighted and obstacles to better performance removed.

#### Positive approach

5. It is pointless conducting appraisals unless these are entered into positively, and always with a view to seeking further improvements as the primary aim.
6. Just like staff appraisal systems then, the entire thrust should be viewed as a tool that helps further build capacity along required organisational lines, and it is important to stress this point often to all of those that will be involved. To this day there remains a natural fear of appraisal systems amongst many workers, and it is wholly unrealistic to imagine that similar concerns will not affect Management Committee members to some degree.
7. CHA is committed to a positive approach to Management Committee appraisals. An appraisal training session for all Management Committee members is provided approximately one month in advance of appraisal meetings to ensure that there was a clear understanding of the process and its objectives.
8. There will be three main parts to Management Committee appraisal:
  - Assessing the Management Committee's collective performance;
  - Individual Management Committee member appraisal;
  - Appraising the Chairperson.

#### Assessing the Management Committee's Collective Performance

9. This component will use a combination of approaches to arrive at an outcome:
  - The Chair will regularly, following a meeting, facilitate Management Committee discussions that review and evaluate Committee's performance with a particular focus on identifying areas for improvement. The Management Committee Meeting Evaluation Record (Appendix 1) will be used to prompt discussions. Areas required for action will be recorded and emailed to the Chief Executive for record-keeping/action.
  - The Committee and management team members will annually self-assess CHA's compliance with Regulatory Standards and use the results to develop an action plan for implementation. CHA will use external consultants to support this activity where required. This will be carried out through a combination of evidence validation and discussion.
  - CHA will conduct facilitated governance workshops that will focus on building on existing governance achievements to further improve and strengthen our approach to governance.
  - Following annual appraisal meetings with individual Committee members, an annual appraisal outcome report will be presented to the Management Committee for consideration. This report will focus on areas for collective improvement and training, as well as establishing annual recruitment

priorities to strengthen the skills and knowledge of the Management Committee.

10. Frank, positive debate within the confines of the Management Committee can be the best way to take forward any identified areas of concern or development, and such discussions should be welcomed rather than avoided.

#### Individual Management Committee Member Appraisal

11. Management Committee members with less than six months experience will be excluded from this stage and will instead participate in an Induction Programme followed by a Training Needs Assessment in order to ensure that they acquire the necessary skills and knowledge to contribute effectively to our work. For Management Committee members with longer service than this, however, this component is designed to encourage participation and will follow these four stages:

Stage 1: Approximately one month before the scheduled individual appraisal meetings, Committee members will participate in a 'Preparing for Appraisal' training session that will promote the benefits of annual appraisals and provide advice and support on how to prepare for and get the most out of the appraisal process.

Stage 2: Individual Management Committee members should complete an on-line self-assessment questionnaire, which in turn will form the basis for the discussion at the appraisal meeting. Further support and guidance will be made available to individual Management Committee members with the self-assessment process where required. The self-assessment questionnaire should be completed and returned no later than one week before the scheduled appraisal meeting.

Stage 3: CHA will appoint a consultant to meet with each individual Committee member to carry out the appraisal meeting. CHA considers this as an appropriate approach in order to encourage independent challenge and frank, yet positive feedback.

- The Chairperson will also participate in individual appraisal meetings where a Committee member is subject to Rule 37.6 (the 'nine year rule'). The Chairperson's participation will enable them to prepare a report on the Committee member's continued effectiveness where they intend to seek re-election to the Management Committee.

Stage 4: The main output of appraisal meetings for individual Committee Members will be an Individual Learning Statement that will summarise their learning and development objectives for the year ahead.

Stage 5: Committee members should review their Individual Learning Statements (see Appendix 2) on an ongoing basis and update them to record learning and development activities completed. Support with learning and development activities and planning will be available to all Committee members throughout the year from the Chairperson and CHA staff.

12. The self-assessment form provides a template for individual member appraisal and covers the following broad areas of enquiry:
  - Personal highlights, motivation and future plans;
  - Skills, knowledge and expertise – structured around Regulatory Standards;
  - Feedback on the performance of the Chairperson.
13. The meeting will start with the individual Management Committee member explaining their self-assessment form before the consultant offers any thoughts. A look back at the last period under review, whilst important, will not dominate the meeting. Key areas of strength/achievements of the member concerned will also be identified – not only in recognition, but also as a potential champion/mentor for others who may be weaker in these areas.
14. The main focus of the meeting, however, will be to identify and jointly agree realistic development needs aimed at improving/maintaining continued effectiveness – this will culminate in agreeing individual learning and development objectives that will be later confirmed in writing in an Individual Learning Statement.
15. It should be noted that it is unrealistic to imagine that in all cases, 100% of skill and knowledge gaps will be closed within a single year, therefore training and development activities will be prioritised accordingly.
16. The consultant will present an outcome report on the annual appraisal process that will:
  - Report on the process and participation levels;
  - Summarise collective self-assessment returns in order to present a collective statement on how the Management Committee rate their skills and knowledge. (This will be used to inform future recruitment priorities);
  - Identify common learning and development priorities for action in the year ahead;
  - Summarise the outcome of the Chair's appraisal.
17. The self-assessment form will be treated as confidential - only those involved in the appraisal meeting and limited staff members responsible for CHA record-keeping will have access to it.
18. In order to comply with Rule 37.6, the Chair will attend the appraisal of Management Committee members with continuous service in excess of 9 years, who are also seeking re-election in order to enable them to prepare and submit a brief report to the Management Committee on the outcome of their assessment on the continued effectiveness. The completed self-assessment form will be held in a confidential record for any future validation purposes.

### Appraising the Chairperson

19. Appraising the Chairperson also includes the self-assessment process used for individual Management Committee members, however, their particular role in leading the Management Committee suggests that a form of 360° appraisal will be helpful. Appraising the Chairperson will therefore include the following stages:

- Chairperson will complete their own online self-assessment questionnaire.
- Meanwhile, fellow Management Committee members will complete a 360° feedback form that focuses on the more specific nature of the Chairperson's role.
- 360° feedback responses will be independently collated by the supporting consultant. These results will form the basis for part of the appraisal discussion with the Chairperson.
- As with other Management Committee member appraisals, the appraisal meeting will proceed with the consultant and culminate in the production of an Individual Learning Statement.
- A summary of the Chairperson's appraisal will be presented by the consultant in the annual appraisal outcome report.

## **Policy Review**

20. This policy will be reviewed every 3 years.

<b>Approved by the Committee of Management on:</b>	
<b>Signed:</b>  <b>Secretary/Chairperson</b>	<b>Signed:</b>  <b>Chief/Depute Chief Executive</b>

## Appendix 1: Management Committee Meeting Evaluation Record

Themes	Pointers
1. The agenda was relevant, clear and well planned.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Are we prioritising the important items first?</li> <li>• Be specific about what changes are wanted, why they are needed and when they have to take place.</li> <li>• In requesting new items, be sensitive to existing staff workloads and responsibilities – take advice from the CEO.</li> </ul>
2. The meeting started and ended on time.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Are we good timekeepers?</li> <li>• Do we go over the 2 hour meeting time regularly?</li> </ul>
3. Reports were of clear, concise and contained the needed information.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Suggested changes need to be specific and realistic – staff need to know exactly where changes are required and have the capacity / capability to deliver them.</li> </ul>
4. Papers were issued sufficiently in advance of the meeting (where possible).	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Do we have enough time to prepare for meetings?</li> <li>• Are there too many AOCB items?</li> </ul>
5. Committee Members obtained necessary clarification in advance of the meeting.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• It is best practice to avoid clarifying terms used in reports – Members should contact the report author in advance in order to save time at the meeting.</li> </ul>
6. All Committee Members contributed effectively to the discussion using 'Constructive Challenge'.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Members should be the main voice at meetings and they should start discussions.</li> <li>• Members should constructively challenge staff <u>and</u> each other, e.g.:               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Is it evident that Members have not prepared for the meeting?</li> <li>• Do Member behaviours show a commitment to our Common Values?</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Staff shouldn't 'talk to reports' unless: a) something has changed since the report was written; or b) the report is not routine <u>and</u> it is a complex or new issue.</li> </ul>
7. Committee Members actively identified relevant risks and agreed mitigation action.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Don't leave risk identification exclusively to staff – are we identifying risks on a regular basis?</li> </ul>
8. Committee Members adhered to our rules, e.g. Code of Conduct, Standing Orders, Equal Opportunities Policy, etc.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Are we displaying the correct behaviours?</li> <li>• Are our meetings orderly and effective?</li> <li>• Are we using language consistent with our equalities commitments?</li> </ul>
9. Committee avoided getting into administrative/operational details.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Are we good at observing the line between strategy (us) &amp; operations (staff)?</li> <li>• If we want a more strategic focus for meetings we need to be specific about what we want to look at and how often.</li> </ul>



<p>10. The Chair guided the meeting effectively and fairly.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Are the agenda times being kept to?</li> <li>• Are all Members having their say?</li> <li>• Is domination by certain Members being avoided?</li> <li>• Are alternative Member points of view being sought in order to avoid blind spots/groupthink?</li> </ul>
<p>11. Relevant action points were agreed, timescales set and responsibilities made clear.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Action points, timescales &amp; responsibilities need to be specific so that people know what's expected of them.</li> <li>• These need to be realistic.</li> </ul>
<p>12. Are there any new learning &amp; development needs from the meeting?</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• What do Committee need briefed on in order to perform their role more effectively?</li> <li>• If we want a more strategic focus, learning &amp; development activity needs to reflect this.</li> </ul>
<p>13. We enjoyed being together.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Be honest – if there is an 'elephant in the room' find ways to respectfully deal with it.</li> <li>• What can we do to make the meetings more enjoyable?</li> </ul>

## Appendix 2: Individual Learning Statement Example

### Individual Learning Statement

Date:

NAME:	A.N Committee Member
TIME ON COMMITTEE	2 Years

1. YOUR THINKING STYLE	Orientation	Focus
	Big Picture	Ideas and possible solutions
<b>Explorer</b>	<p>Your chosen preferences, a combination of <b>Big Picture and Ideas and possible solutions</b>, suggest your thinking style is that of <b>Explorer</b> – someone whose thinking is primarily focussed on generating creative ideas.</p> <p><b>Reflect:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• How effectively do you use your preferred style in debate and decision-making on the Committee?</li> <li>• Are there steps you could take to strengthen your preferences and be more effective?</li> <li>• Conversely, how do you work with those whose style may be different to yours, who prefer to delve into the details, develop strategies and plans, take action or help people reach their potential?</li> <li>• Also, are there ways in which your thinking style may hinder you in fulfilling your role as a Committee member?</li> </ul>	

2. Skills, Knowledge & Specialisms	Category Scores (where 1 is low and 5 is high)	
<p>This section lists your average score for each of the 8 categories where you rated your knowledge and understanding on a scale of 1-5.</p> <p>1 = "This is an area I know very little about." 5 = "This is an area of specialist knowledge or skill, people respect my opinion on this."</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Committee experience</li> <li>2. Risk</li> <li>3. Communication</li> <li>4. Business, finance &amp; management</li> <li>5. Governance</li> <li>6. Housing legislation and policy</li> <li>7. Funding, planning &amp; development</li> <li>8. Tenants, customers &amp; communities</li> </ol>	<p>5.0 4.7 4.7 4.6 4.0 3.8 3.8 3.6</p>
<p><b>Reflect:</b> Learning theory suggests that we should develop areas of strength to increase our effectiveness. However, it's also important to develop those areas in which we are less knowledgeable or skilled through learning and development.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• How are you developing your areas of strength?</li> <li>• How are you using these as you contribute to the Committee?</li> <li>• Are there any barriers to using your strengths on the Committee?</li> <li>• How will you develop or compensate for the areas with lower scores?</li> </ul>		

3. Particular Interests	Areas of particular interest	Reflect:
You were asked to list areas of the Committee's work that you are particularly interested in.	You mentioned: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Strategy</li> <li>• Finance</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• What can you do to develop these interests within the Association as a Committee member?</li> <li>• Are there specific roles or tasks on the Committee in which these particular interests are a main focus? If so, how can you get involved?</li> </ul>

4. Recommendations	Learning and Development Topics
<p>Your self-assessment scores ranged across the scale with committee experience, risk and communication at the higher end.</p> <p>There are a couple of areas at the lower end that you may wish to consider for further development.</p> <p>We recommend that everyone keep up to date with current developments in the sector.</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Keep up to date with developments in the sector that directly impact on the role of the Committee.</li> <li>2. Develop a greater awareness of tenants' aspirations and the challenges they face.</li> <li>3. Refresh your knowledge and understanding of the SSHC outcomes and the Committee's role to ensure their delivery.</li> </ol>

**5. My Personal Development Plan:** From the information above create your own learning and development plan. You may find this framework useful in your planning.

TOPIC	What are my specific learning needs?	How will I achieve my goals?	Whose help do I need with this?	When will I have completed this?	Date achieved
1.					
2.					
3.					
4.					